Summary of the Seminar
“Selection and categorization criteria for the 4th round re-evaluation for TCI indexed journals (2020-2024)”
During September 28 – October 17, 2018

1. Introduction

The Thai-Journal Citation Index Centre (TCI) has set up the TCI database as an Index & Abstract (with citation) database since 2002 to house Thai journal information, the bibliographic records as well as the references of articles published in the Thai academic journals. The TCI has been the first and only national citation index in Thailand which has been in business for 16 years and has received well recognition from the scholarly community and policy makers.

The number of academic journals indexed in the TCI has grown considerably, from 100 titles in 2004 to 809 in 2018. The database has been widely used by authors, reviewers, editors, students, universities, and policy makers, e.g. The Office of Higher Education Commission (OHEC), the Thailand Research Funds (TRF) and the Office for National Education Standards and Quality Assessment. The policy makers have used TCI data for implementing related national policies, such as for academic promotion and for graduation. In late 2018, the Minister of Education makes use of the TCI seriously by announcing that articles published in the Tier 1 journals can be used and considered for academic promotion to become a professor in social science discipline. Therefore, the journals indexed in the TCI need the re-evaluation to guarantee the quality.

Regarding the re-evaluation process, the TCI has done 3 rounds of journal re-evaluation for categorising the existing journals according to their quality. A number of criteria have been developed and used for the re-evaluation process. The 3 rounds of the re-evaluation were done in 2012, 2013, and 2015. The journals were categorized into three Tier according to the marks receiving against the set criteria. In 2018, there are 427 journal titles categorised in Tier 1, 291 in Tier 2 and 91 in Tier 3. These categories will last for 5 years till Dec 2019. As the 3rd round of the re-evaluation will end soon, the TCI needs to perform the fourth round of the re-evaluation next year (2019). Therefore the new set of criteria, seen below, were developed and tested.
2. Criteria for re-evaluation of journals indexed in the TCI, Round 4 (effective 1st January 2020 - 31st December 2024 (5 years guarantee))

2.1 Main criteria (no mark counts, but journals to be drawn in Tier 1 have to pass these criteria)

1. Timeliness
2. Has ISSN registered in ISSN.ORG
3. Website (completed and up-to-date)
4. Published articles must conform with the international standards

2.2 Additional criteria (mark counts, full mark = 20)

1. Citations that can be verified in the TCI
2. Diversity of Editors
3. Diversity of Authors
4. Standardised References
5. Peer-review process
6. Online journal/submission
7. Quality of articles
8. Other Related quality

Note: The new criteria were yellowed marked and appeared in italic.

3. Seminar for Editors throughout Thailand

To inform the Editors and the editorial board members about the new set criteria, TCI organized 4 seminars in three parts of the country: the central, the northern and the northeastern parts during September 28-October 17, 2018 in Bangkok, Chiang Mai and Khon Kaen, respectively. The programme was showed in Annex 1. The seminar schedule and the number of the participants are showed below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Round</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Venue</th>
<th>No of participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>September 28, 2018</td>
<td>Ambassador Hotel, Bangkok</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>October 2, 2018</td>
<td>Kanery Hill, Chiang Mai</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>October 9, 2018</td>
<td>Avani Hotel, Khon Kaen</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>October 17, 2018</td>
<td>Ambassador Hotel, Bangkok</td>
<td>520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1520</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During the four round of the events, a number of questions and concerns were asked and raised. The questions were grouped and detailed below.
4. Questions from the audience

1) Journals already indexed in Scopus and WoS, do we have to submit for the re-evaluation in this round?

2) ISSN, a journal already has ISSN in the ISSN.ORG, but the Thai name appeared there as the romanised name, not the journal title in proper English language. In this case, what need to be done?
   • Journals published in printed version and want to change to online version, do we need a new ISSN?
   • If we want to publish in both formats, printed and online versions, can we use the same ISSN?

3) Journal name, how to change the name of the journals?

4) Peer-review process, if a reviewer accepts an article, but the editor considered that the quality is not there yet. Can the Editor reject the paper?
   • One reviewer returns the reviewed paper while the other reviewer takes so much time for the review. So the Editor accepted the article, but the second reviewer rejected the article? What should the editor do?
   • Does Book Review have to go through the peer-review process like that of the research article?
   • Does Book Review section count as one original article?

5) Editor/Editorial Board/Reviewer
   • Can the editor publish his/her own paper in the journal they serve as the Editors, either as a corresponding author or as a co-author?
   • Can the editorial board members publish their papers in the journals they serve as the editorial board members?
   • Can editorial board members serve as reviewers in the same journals?
   • Is there any policy related to how many journals a person should serve as the editorial board member?
   • Can reviewers published papers in a journal they serve as the peer-reviewers?
6) **Special issue VS Supplement issue**
   - The difference between the special issue and the supplement issue
   - Can a journal publish a special issue, if it does not state in the aim and scope of the journal?
   - There was a conference organized by a university abroad. The University contacted our journal to publish articles presented in the Conference. They confirmed that all articles had peer-review process. In this case, should we publish those articles? Will TCI evaluate this issue?
   - Will TCI index the articles published in the two mentioned issues?
   - Special issue published only papers from a conference, is this acceptable?

7) **Article details**
   - How to evaluate quality of the articles in each journal?
   - Received, Revised, and Accepted dates, can we add these information in the online version only? The information may take a lot of space in the printed version and does not look good.
     - Will those dates be the same dates as appeared in the ThaiJo system?
     - If so, it may not possible as the staff will post the information later.
     - Will this acceptable by TCI?
   - Language, metadata of articles in printed version published only in Thai, will it be possible to add English language in the on-line version?
   - Can Thai journals publish articles in other languages, e.g. Chinese, Japanese?
   - Author, what is the maximum number of authors in one paper? In case there were 3 advisors and 1 student, can the 4 persons be named as the authors?
   - Should academic title and level of education be add in the author detail in an article?
   - References, how to romanise references from Thai language to English?
   - Why shouldn’t website be cited?, if a journal has its own website and available online, how to cite the journal?
   - Invited paper, should the invited paper follow the same format as that of the normal paper, e.g. has abstract in both Thai and English?

8) **How to evaluate the online journal system?**

9) **Diversity of author, if there is no paper written by anyone inside the university that own the journal, will it be fine?**

10) **How to evaluate the citation of the journal, is it citation per article or times cited?**
11) Plagiarism, who will take responsibility for plagiarism checking, the Editor or the author?

12) Cover of a journal, what information should appear or should not in the cover of each journal? Is there any standard for this matter?

13) Advertisement in a journal, is it allowed to have any advertisement in a journal, if so, how many pages?

14) TCI related issues

- Can journals that own by foundations, which has no relation to any university, be indexed in the TCI?
- If journals change their names this year, will they be eligible to get into the TCI?
- Can journals in Tier 1 publish articles authored by graduated students, either master or PhD levels?
- Should journals in Tier 1, charge for the publication fee or not?
- In selecting 10 papers for quality evaluation, will it be possible to expand the publication year to 5 years?
  - Do the 10 papers need to be research papers only?
  - Do the 10 papers must have all criteria that meet with the new criteria announcing today?

- If a journal still has paper-based peer review process, how the journal should get the information ready for sending out to TCI for the re-evaluation?
- Discipline, how to select the disciplines for our journal, as we publish articles in science and technology areas.
- How many articles should be published in one issue?
- What is the most suitable time spending on the review process, starting from receiving the manuscript, peer-reviewing and publishing?
- We are in the ThaiJo system, do we need to send printed volumes for impact factor calculation?
- How TCI select journals to be included in ACI and TCI-TRF-Scopus project?
5. Conclusion

- It can be clearly seen that, according to the large number of participants attended the event, TCI has a crucial role to play on Thai journal quality improvement. This kind of experience can be shared elsewhere particularly in the ASEAN region.
- With respect to the audience, it was observed that most of the posted questions related to the practical issue, (how to do, can I do, should I do... questions) which imply that most of the Editors and the editorial board members have limited knowledge on how to run the journal effectively.
- In addition, some of them are more concerned about using the conference papers in the special issues for academic promotion and graduation, and not about the quality of the papers.

6. Suggestions

1. TCI should gather and post all these questions and answers into the TCI website, so that the editors can learn by themselves. This will help saving the staff time in answering all the repeated questions.
2. The process on how to do the re-evaluation and the time frame should be detailing and scheduling and post it in the TCI website for widely access.
3. Training course for Editors should be considered.
4. New journals should not be encouraged but rather improve the quality of the existing journals.
5. More journals should be recommended to Scopus and WoS.
6. TCI should help journal editors to improve the citations and author diversities of journals to meet with Scopus Criteria.
### Annex 1: The Programme of the Seminar

**Selection and categorization criteria for the 4th round re-evaluation for TCI indexed journals (2020-2024)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>09.30-10.00</td>
<td>Registration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.00-10.10</td>
<td><strong>Welcoming and Introductory remarks</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>By Prof. Dr. Narongrit Sombatsompop, Head of the TCI Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.10-10.45</td>
<td><strong>Selection and categorization criteria for the 4th round re-evaluation for TCI indexed journals</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>By Prof. Dr. Narongrit Sombatsompop, Head of the TCI Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.45-11.00</td>
<td>Coffee Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.00-12.00</td>
<td><strong>Selection and categorization criteria for the 4th round re-evaluation for TCI indexed journals (Cont.)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>By Prof. Dr. Narongrit Sombatsompop, Head of the TCI Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.00-12.30</td>
<td><strong>Q &amp; A</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>By TCI Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.30-13.30</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.30-14.15</td>
<td><strong>Selection criteria for Thai journals to be indexed in the ASEAN Citation Index (ACI)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>By Dr. Nongyao Sripromsuk, ACI Secretariat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.15-15.00</td>
<td><strong>Scopus for Editors</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>By Scopus Representative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.00-15.15</td>
<td>Coffee break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.15-16.00</td>
<td><strong>Q &amp; A</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>By TCI team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.00</td>
<td><strong>Closing</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>