
**Minutes of
6th ASEAN Citation Index (ACI) Steering Committee Meeting
October 31st - November 1st, 2018,
The Anantara Riverside Bangkok Resort and the Ramada Plaza Bangkok
Menam Riverside, Bangkok, Thailand**

Introduction

1. Office of the Higher Education Commission (OHEC), Ministry of Education, Thailand in cooperation with Thai-Journal Citation Index Centre (TCI) hosted the Sixth ASEAN Citation Index Steering Committee Meeting on October 31st – November 1st, 2018 at the Anantara Riverside Bangkok Resort and the Ramada Plaza Bangkok Menam Riverside, Bangkok, Thailand.
2. The Meeting comprised of 2 events. The first event was the "*ACI Steering Committee meet with the Scopus Subject Chairs*" which was held on October 31st, 2018. This special event aimed to create better understanding among the ACI Steering Committee members about the roles and responsibilities of Scopus subject chairs and the STEP system and the Subject Chairs about the ACI. At the same time it aimed to seek possible collaboration between Scopus and ASEAN Citation Index databases. The audiences were 17 CSAB Subject Chairs, 7 Scopus staff, 18 ACI Steering committee members, 5 representatives from Thai OHEC and 5 TCI staff. The second event was the *6th ACI Steering Committee Meeting* which was held on November 1st, 2018. The meeting was participated by 42 ACI Steering Committee members and representatives from 10 ASEAN member countries, namely Brunei Darussalam, Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Malaysia, Myanmar, the Philippines, Singapore, Thailand and Viet Nam. The participants included executives from OHEC, National Electronics and Computer Technology Centre (NECTEC), ACI secretariats and guest speakers.

The list of participants on November 1st, 2018 appears in Annex 1.

Special Event on October 31st, 2018 : ACI Steering Committee meet with the Scopus Subject Chairs

3. Prof. Dr. Narongrit Sombatsompop, the Chairman of the ACI Steering Committee members delivered an introductory remarks on the *initiatives and challenges on establishing of ASEAN Citation Index (ACI) database*. He highlighted why ASEAN needs the ACI, how the ACI has been developed and implemented, the ACI Steering Committee members from 10 ASEAN countries, the ACI journal profiles and its activities since 2010. Then Prof. Peter Miller, Scopus Subject Chair Representative presented the roles and responsibilities of Scopus subject chairs and STEP system to inform the audience, followed by discussion on possible collaboration between Scopus and ASEAN Citation Index database. Scopus would like to replicate the Thai pilot project, the TCI-TRF-Scopus project, to ASEAN countries.

Opening Session

4. Dr. Aurasia Pavavimol, Deputy Secretary-General for Higher Education Commission, Thailand delivered remarks by welcoming all ACI steering committee members and guest speakers to Bangkok, Thailand. Her speech was focusing on an importance of Research and Development (R&D) in building the strong foundation of the knowledge-based society and sustainability. ASEAN Citation Index (ACI) would be one mechanism to increase visibility and availability of the research outputs in ASEAN region. She showed her gratitude on six consecutive years of the collaboration among ASEAN nations in this issue.

5. Keynote speakers

- **Speaker 1:** Prof. Dr. Michael Khor Khiam Aik, Director of the Talent Recruitment and Career Support (TRACS) Office and Bibliometrics Analysis, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore "Citation impact of ASEAN publications: global recognition and leadership"

The speaker pointed out that research publications must be seen in the context of the *Research Enterprise* as it was connected to the economy. While the number of ASEAN publications has increased considerably, ASEAN needs to capitalize them and to select research topics that could lead to certain improvement, development and impact to the society. He also presented the overall research performance and impact for ASEAN countries derived from Incite (Clarivate Analytics) during 2013-2018, which showed overall publication outputs, international collaboration, citations, Field Weighted Citation Impact (FWCI) and author keywords. Collaborating country couples and more among ASEAN and the collaborated topics were mapped and presented. The speaker concluded that to be able to go far, ASEAN should go together.

- **Speaker 2:** Mr. Jeroen Prinsen and Mr. Lee Inn Beng, Clarivate Analytics, "Journal performance improvement: Tripartite partners for building capacity, visibility and impact"

The speakers presented two platforms that could help improve the journal performances. The first one was the WoS Editorial engagement which would help the Editors to perform their work better and the other was Publons which would help reviewers in peer review process, especially the review recognitions.

The power point presentations of the first speaker appear in Annex 2.

6. Discussion session

There were four topics in this discussion session among the ACI Steering Committee members, which included 1) Partnership collaboration for enhancing research performance between ACI and international databases 2) Scopus local board for ASEAN 3) Journal categorization in ACI and 4) ASEAN Open Journal System. Detail of each topic was elaborated below.

6.1 The “Partnership collaboration for enhancing research performance between ACI and international databases” was discussed after the meeting with 2 major companies, Elsevier and Clarivate Analytics. Scopus proposed to replicate the successful TCI-TRF-Scopus Collaboration project with the ASEAN countries and appointed Prof. Narongrit Sombatsompop as the Chair of the ASEAN local board whereas Clarivate Analytics proposed to improve the quality of research and journals through effective review process, which involved reviewers’ training.

6.2 The Scopus local board for ASEAN, the meeting agreed that ASEAN should work with Scopus with similar model and approach as that of the TCI-TRF-Scopus collaboration project. This ASEAN-Scopus collaboration pilot project aimed for 3 years in the first phase. In case of the collaboration with Clarivate Analytics (CA), the meeting agreed that the Clarivate Analytics will work with each country individually, unless CA re-approach in ASEAN level in the future.

In replication of the TCI-TRF-Scopus collaboration project, the ACI Steering Committee members also agreed in 3 related matters which were a) selection method for the Local Board for ASEAN-Scopus collaboration pilot project, b) number of local boards for 31 Scopus disciplines and c) selection method for the ASEAN journals to be in the pilot project. The ACI Steering Committee members agreed that

- a) Selection method for the local board for ASEAN-Scopus pilot project : each country agreed to nominate 3-5 researchers who have actively published their research articles in Scopus to the ACI Secretariat. In addition, the list of the publications of each nominee should also provide. The ACI secretariat will then map the publications with Scopus disciplines in order to identify the subject matters which each local board would take responsible for.
- b) Number of local boards for 31 Scopus disciplines: it was agreed that all ASEAN members will nominate 3-5 experts to enter the selection process based on the experts’ research performance. One local board can take roles in 2-3 subject fields. However, Prof. Narongrit confirmed that each country would have representative(s) to serve as local boards for ASEAN in this pilot project.
- c) Regarding the selection of the ASEAN journals to be included in the pilot project, it was agreed that the ASEAN journals to be included in the project should be selected from the ACI database.

6.3 Journal categorization in ACI. Prof.Narongrit informed that the Thai OHEC is working on bringing the ACI journals into consideration for academic promotion. Therefore journals indexed in the ACI would be re-evaluation and categorization for quality improvement. The meeting agreed that journals indexed in the ACI should be categorized according to its quality and impacts. The quality and impact depend on the citation/article ratio appeared in the Scopus. This citation counts should involve publications in the last 4 years. This score is agreed to be named as "**ACI Score**". The *ACI score* will be ranked according to its percentile.

6.4 ASEAN Open Journal System

Dr. Krich Nasingkun proposed an Online Journal System (OJS) for ASEAN countries that have limited resources in providing online platform for domestic journal management. The ASEAN OJS will be developed and maintained by the National Electronics and Computer Technology Center (NECTEC), Thailand. The proposed subscription fee was 500 USD per year.

6.5 Other related issues:

- Indonesia commented that the process of evaluation and the acceptance journals into the ACI was very slow, as it approved once a year. Therefore the meeting agreed that the evaluation and notification of the results would be 2 rounds, in April and October, each year.
- Malaysia would like Malaysian Editors to submit their journals for ACI directly to MCC, not to the ACI website like previously done. So Malaysia requested the ACI Secretariat to disable the submission of Malaysian journals from the ACI Submission Option and instruct Editors to submit the Journal directly to the MCC.
- Indonesia would also like the ACI Secretariat to disable the submission of Indonesian journals from the ACI Submission Option and instruct Editors to submit the Journal directly to the Sinta.
- The two requests were amended in the ACI Submission Option in the ACI Website.

7. Update on the progress of the ACI

Dr. Nongyao Sripromsuk, ACI Secretariat and Dr. Choochart Haruechaiyasak, Director of Artificial Intelligence Research Group, NECTEC updated activities and events undertaken by the ACI Secretariat last year. These included ACI Steering Committee member profiles, data inputting, journal evaluation, editor workshops, ACI database and the website, the ACI sustainability:2018 country contribution for ACI sustainability, expected ACI activities in 2019 and the next meeting.

7.1 ACI Steering Committee members : Most of the Members are the same persons, e.g. those from Cambodia, Indonesia, Lao PDR, Malaysia, Singapore, Thailand and Vietnam. However, there are new nominations from Myanmar to replace the former Members who are in retirement. In addition, Members from the Philippines, one from Vietnam and 2 from Brunei Darussalam will be replaced and nominated. Therefore nomination letters from the 3 mentioned Ministry of Education are required.

7.2 Data inputting: all the 407 approved journals in 2014-17 were already input in the ACI database system. The required information was general information of the 407 journals, metadata of the articles and the references. As of 12 October 2018, the ACI database system comprises of 72,321 bibliographic records.

7.3 Journal Evaluation for the ACI : There were 334 journals from 6 countries submitted for the evaluation this year. Of the 334, 227 from Indonesia, 1 from Lao PDR, 30 from Malaysia, 17 from the Philippines, 50 from Thailand, and 9 from Vietnam. However, only 156 journals from 5 countries met with the ACI criteria.

7.4 Organisation of the Editor's Workshop: The ACI secretariat organized 2 workshops in Cambodia and Brunei Darussalam on July 4th, 2018 and September 6th, 2018, respectively. Those workshops focused on the ACI criteria and allowing the participants to evaluate their journals against the criteria.

7.5 Improving the ACI database system : the database schema was revised, the metadata input system and the ACI official website were redesigned. In addition, the search function and the user interface of the ACI was improved.

7.6 ACI sustainability: 2018 country contribution :

- The yearly country contributions were agreed by the last meeting based on the number of indexed journals in the ACI. There are two countries, Malaysia and Thailand, had already contributed USD 10,000 and 70,000, respectively, for ACI sustainability.
- Three countries, namely Indonesia, the Philippines and Vietnam are in process of arranging the contribution. However, Indonesia stated that the country already contributed USD 1 million to the Association of Southeast Asian Nations, so the ACI should write to the Association and ask for the contribution. The Philippines had allocated the budget for the contribution, but need a formal letter from Thai OHEC which stated that the ACI is regarded as one of the collaboration projects among ASEAN countries. Vietnam promised to follow this up with Prof Le Quoc Hoi, the ACI Steering Committee for Vietnam.
- Regarding ACI as the ASEAN agenda, Singapore confirmed that ACI is already part of the ASEAN collaboration project as he has to report the ACI activities to Singapore Ministry of Education.
- At the end all Members agreed to seek budget for 2018 ACI contribution.
- Thai OHEC agreed to provide formal letter which stated that ACI is part of the ASEAN collaboration project as well as in the ASEAN agenda.

7.7 Next ACI meeting in 2019: Prof. Khor, the ACI Steering Committee for Singapore stated that he has asked for funding in organizing the 7th ACI Steering Committee Meeting in Singapore next year. (2019). The provision date will be in the second week of November, 2019.

The power point presentation appears in Annex 3

8. Country Progress Report

The ACI Steering Committee members representing each respective ASEAN member country presented the country progress reports which were summarized as follow:

Brunei Darussalam :

- Has 3 universities, 1 university college and 1 polytechnic
- Has one journal, the Brunei International Medical Journal, indexed in the ACI
- Universiti Brunei Darussalam (UBD) and Universiti Teknologi Brunei (UTB) Jointly organized an Editor's Workshop with ACI Secretariat to 45 participants on September 6, 2018 in Brunei to create awareness about the ACI journal selection criteria. The workshop on evaluation journals against the set criteria was conducted and 4 research journals were brought in for the evaluation. Most of them targeted to be indexed in the ACI in a near future
- New journals from UBD and UTB are planned and focused to meet with the ACI criteria.
- Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali (UNISSA) currently published 3 journals
- More journals from Brunei are expected to submit for possible inclusion in the ACI database.

Cambodia

- Government budget through WORLD Bank loan has been allocated for improving of research performance of the country. The Cambodia Citation Index (CCI) has been set up and the space located at the Institute of Technology for Cambodia (ITC).
- At present, 5 universities can issue journals namely, Royal University of Phnom Pehn, Institute of Technology for Cambodia, Center for Khmer Studies, Cambodia Agricultural Research and Development Institute, and Royal University of Agriculture.
- One Cambodian journal, Cambodian Journal of Natural History, has been indexed in the ACI since 2017.
- The second ACI workshop aiming at introducing the ACI journal selection criteria and preparing a Cambodian journal for Scopus was organized during 4 July 2018 in Phnom Penh.

Indonesia

- New policies have been implemented after the unification of Ministry of Research and Technology and the Directorate General of Higher Education, Ministry of Education and Culture. The policies included grant competitions, monitoring and evaluation of research, key performance index, and ranking system
- New decree from the ministry stated that all graduate students are required to have international publications before their graduation. Therefore the Office of IPR and Publication establishes a strategic program on journal quality improvement.

- SINTA (Science and Technology Index), which established in 2016 by the Ministry of Research Technology and Higher Education, is a web-based research information system that provided benchmarks and analysis, identification of research strength of each institution, and analyse the trend of research and expert directories.
- SINTA is an Indonesian journal accreditation system. The journals in SINTA-1 and -2 are nationally accredited by the ARJUNA 1 and 2, respectively. Journals that are indexed in Scopus are directly indexed in ARJUNA-1. Journals in SINTA-3-6 are not nationally accredited. All evaluation and scoring systems are conducted in ARJUNA. Criteria of journal accreditation, scoring, and work flow were clarified.
- Workshops on internationalization of Indonesian journals were organized. The responds of Indonesian journals towards ACI are very positive.
- Indonesia submitted 223 journals to be indexed in ACI this year.

Lao PDR

- There are 7 journals published in Lao PDR which are NUOL Scientific Journal, Journal of Public Health University, Journal of NAFRI: Lao Journal of Agriculture and Forestry, Journal of Politics and Government, The Journal of National Economics Research Institute, Journal of Agricultural Science, technology and Development, JASTD”, and the International Journal of Research and Methodology in Social Science (IJRMSS)
- Of the 7, 3 journals have high potential for the ACI which are 1) NAFRI: Lao Journal of Agriculture and Forestry 2) Journal of Public Health university 3) NUOL journal
- The quality of the NUOL has improved in many parts, e.g. the format, the editorial board, the website and the regulation of NUOL Research Coordination Committee (RCC) in terms of citation system, decimal using and type of Lao front.

Malaysia

- MCC established by Ministry of Higher Education in 2011 aiming to improve and increase ability and visibility of scientific publications. MCC has 2 databases; MyJournal and MyCite to monitor journals performances before submitting to international indexing database.
- There were 552 journals with 73,198 records indexed in My Jurnal, whereas 236 journals with 57264 articles indexed in MyCite. For international and regional databases, there were 88, 68, and 100 journals indexed in Scopus, WoS and ACI, respectively.
- In November 2018, Malaysia submitted another 19 journals, 9 from direct submission to ACI website and 10 suggested by MCC, and expect to be approved to be indexed in ACI

Myanmar

- The progress on establishment of the MnCI is not going at a fast speed.
- Current Research Publication in Myanmar : 162 institutions doing research under the categories of arts, humanities, natural science, medical research and Significant numbers of universities having experience in producing quality research in different fields
- National policy for Quality Research : Aim to develop criteria, benchmark and norms for quality research and education worked by National Accreditation and Quality Assurance (NAQAC) in 2018
- Need to create more awareness of ACI and the journal selection criteria for the ACI to research institutes in Myanmar
- Need to speed up the MnCI establishment

The Philippines

- Commission would nominate the new ACI Steering Committee to replace Director Napoleon Juanillo.
- Funds for ACI sustainability were allocated for the contribution of the Philippines subject to documents being requested from the Thai OHEC.
- Philippines Citation Index started in 2015 but was not sustained because it was commissioned on a project-basis. The Commission will work with universities to rebuild the index to be covered by a long term MOA.
- Journal Incentive Program (JIP) :
 - In 2018, 14 journals were endorsed for the ACI based on scoring done by the staff.
 - The Program was reviewed to ensure that there is a memorandum of agreement between publisher and the Commission.
 - Targeted to include more publication in reputable journals and international rankings into the Program
- Moving forward:
 - Provide continuing targeted technical assistance to journals
 - Support journals to internationalize both in submissions and editorial boards
 - Require English language abstracts for Filipino publications
 - Support institutions to host/edit existing international journals
 - Support possibly through incentives co-authorship with scholars from abroad

Singapore

- There were 8 journals from Singapore indexed in the ACI. All journals, except East Asian Policy, have submitted metadata content to ACI.
- 805 articles are indexed in ACI which received 24 citations. The content increased by 36% since October 2017.
- Regarding content coverage, articles from 5 journals, namely Asian journal of international law, Asian journal of social science, China: an international

journal, Contemporary Southeast Asia and Singapore economic review, was indexed from 2013-2017. The other 2 journals, the Sojourn and the Journal of Southeast Asian economies was indexed from 2015-2018 and 2016-2018, respectively.

Thailand

- Maintaining and updating the TCI database system
 - In 2018, the number of journals indexed in the TCI were 809 titles
 - organizing the 12th TCI Symposium on Thai Scholarly journals: towards national impacts and international quality for editors and editorial boards on March 9th, 2018. The effect of new academic promotion system (2017) on quality of TCI journals was highlighted.
- The seminar on the 4th round of TCI journal quality re-evaluation (2020-2025) was organized 4 times in 3 in Bangkok, Northern and northeastern part of the country to inform Editors and editorial board members on new the criteria, both main and optional criteria. There were 1300 editors participated in the events.
- Thai-Online Journal System (Thai-JO) and the Extraction and Plagiarism Checking System (EPS)
 - The Thai-Jo new version has been implemented and the training courses has been provided to interested editors.
 - There are 501 TCI journals use this Thai-Jo platform for the management and easy access.
 - the Extraction and Plagiarism Checking System (EPS) has been plugged in the Thai-Jo system and will automatically run the EPS for plagiarism checking.
- TCI-TRF-Scopus collaboration project
 - Aimed to proactively suggest 40 Thai journals to be indexed in Scopus by reducing turnaround time for Scopus title evaluation process
 - Funded by the Thailand Research Fund, from 28 April 2017 – 27 April 2020.
 - The project workflow was elaborated which included a number of trainings, workshops and meetings with the editors and the local boards.
 - 17 journals were submitted to Scopus and 17 were accepted (acceptance rate was 100%)

Vietnam

- Prime Minister issued Decision No. 37/2018/QĐ-TTg: New requirements for candidates of Associate Professors and Professors; in which publishing international publications on Scopus; ISI are compulsory.
- Vietnam Citation Index:
 - MOET to work with the State Council for Professor Title for the establishment of Vietnam Citation Index Center (VCI);
 - Some progress on VCI: set up Journal Selection Criteria based on ACI and Scopus Criteria, initial establishment of database system.

- There were, however, many related challenges in establishing the Citation Index Centre, e.g. financial issue, leading roles and lack of experiences.
- Future action:
 - Discuss next steps of setting up VCI: Call for State's financial support for VCI; set up VCI Steering Committee, Journal selection process, etc...
 - More workshops for journal editors to provide academic and social services as well as training and consultancy on how to improve the journal quality across the country;
 - Have exchanging experiences with ASEAN countries.
 - Sign contract with international publishers like Emerald for having hosting services.
 - Encourage journals to submit to be indexed in the ACI and Scopus.

The country progress reports are in Annex 4.

- ▶ Brunei Darussalam ▶ Cambodia ▶ Indonesia ▶ Lao PDR ▶ Malaysia
▶ Myanmar ▶ Philippines ▶ Singapore ▶ Thailand ▶ Vietnam

9. Approval of New Journals for Indexing in ACI

There were 334 journals submitted for evaluations, but only 156 journal titles met the set criteria. The Steering Committee has approved the 156 journals for inclusion in ACI database. The 156 journals comprises of 92 journals from Indonesia, 28 journals from Thailand, 19 journals from Malaysia, 14 journals from Philippines, and 3 journals from Vietnam.

The list of 156 approved journals in 2018 appears in Annex 5.

10. Closing remarks

Dr. Luksmon Smansin, Educator, Senior Professional Level, Bureau of International Cooperation Strategy expressed her appreciation to all the Steering Committee members, the guest speakers and the participants for their valuable contributions to the meeting. She also thanked TCI team for organizing the 6th ACI Steering Committee Meeting.